

900319 and 900320 - Demolition of rear extension and fence and erection of extension to form garden room, lobby and porch - Conditionally approved 18/04/1990

POLICY:

Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 repeats the duty imposed under S54A of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and requires that decision must be made in accordance with relevant Development Plan Documents unless material considerations indicate otherwise,

Relevant Development Plan Documents

Somerset and Exmoor National Park Joint Structure Plan
Policy 9 - The Built Historic Environment

South Somerset Local Plan (Adopted April 2006)
EH1 - Conservation Areas
EH3 - Change of Use of Listed Buildings and Alterations to Listed Buildings

PPG15 - Planning and the Historic Environment

CONSULTATIONS:

Town/Parish Council:

No objections.

Area Engineer:

No comment.

Conservation Officer:

No objection.

English Heritage:

The application should be determined in accordance with local and national policy guidance and specialist conservation advice.

County Archaeology:

No objection.

Council for British Archaeology:

Our initial letter of the 12th February objected to the loss of the later stair and I am afraid that we must reiterate our objection to its loss (the revised application proposes to enclose the new stair but still shows demolition). From a brief inspection of the feature it would seem to be inserted late 18th/early 19th century and probably a service stair to access the lower end of the 1st floor from the service end of the house, suggesting farm or house servants may have used these chambers. It is therefore of historic merit and part of the development of the farmhouse. It is also the only original stair left in the house which has seen a 20th century staircase built to provide access to the east and middle chambers from the 20th century rear extension.

In addition the installation of the new staircase would involve further loss of historic fabric as 2 metre lengths of approximately 7 floor joists would have to be removed and no details of the ramifications of this, or of the new feature, have been provided.

The proposed removal of a partially blocked window on the West elevation after removal of the staircase must also be examined. The justification given is that it will provide much needed light but additional light has already been provided on the south elevation by the replacement of a window by French doors, although construction of a 20th century lean-to along the south elevation restricts light.

We note that many early and original features such as planked doors remain but there is no mention as to what is to happen to them - we would have liked this information.

There are numerous paragraphs of PPG 15 that we could quote in support of retaining historic staircases, features that belong to later phases of the buildings development and providing justification for proposals ie Annex C 62 and paras 3.13 and 3.4 respectively.

In summary we believe that as submitted, these proposals are not justifiable and would unacceptably damage the integrity of the listed building. We therefore ask you to refuse consent for the application.

CONSIDERATIONS:

Section 16 of the Listed Building and Conservation Areas Act is the starting point for the exercise of listed building control. This places a statutory requirement on local planning authorities to 'have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses'.

PPG 15: Planning and the Historic Environment is applicable. Applicants for listed building consent must be able to justify their proposals. They will need to show why works, which would affect the character of a listed building are desirable or necessary. They should provide the local planning authority with full information, to enable them to assess the likely impact of their proposals on the special architectural or historic interest of the building and on its setting.

Whilst Section 38(6) of the 2004 Planning Act is not relevant to this listed building application, the following policies should be considered in the context of the application, as these policies are in accordance with PPG 15: Policy 9 of the Somerset and Exmoor National Park Joint Structure Plan and policies EH3 and EH1 of the South Somerset Local Plan (Adopted April 2006).

The main issue with this application is whether the reinstatement of the historic room form of the kitchen would outweigh the loss of the partitions and staircase required to achieve that potential conservation gain. The staircase appears to represent a nineteenth century alteration, is of very plain construction and detracts somewhat from the form and the proportions of the original lower end room to this room and through passage house. On this basis it is considered that its loss would be outweighed by the benefit in returning the room to the form, which represents the more significant earlier phases of the house.

The application is acceptable by reason of its limited intervention into the historic fabric of the Listed Building. The application will not detract from the architectural and historic character of the Listed Building.

The Conservation Officer is satisfied that the proposed works are acceptable subject to relevant conditions.

The proposal is consequently recommended for approval due to the above considerations.

RECOMMENDATION:

Refer the recommendation to approve to GOSW (Government Office for the South West).

JUSTIFICATION:

The proposal by reason of its size, scale, design, materials and position, and its informed intervention into the historic fabric of this listed building, is considered to respect the historic and architectural interests of the building and is in accordance with policy 9 of the Joint Structure Plan Review, policy EH3 and EH1 of the South Somerset Local Plan, and the provisions of PPG 15.

Application Permitted with Conditions

1. The works hereby granted consent shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Reason: As required by Section 16(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2. No work shall be carried out on site unless details of the design, materials and external finish for all new openings have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This will include detailed drawings including sections of at least 1:5. Such approved details, once carried out shall not be altered without the prior written consent of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the special architectural and historic interests of the Listed Building in accordance with PPG15 and EH3 of the South Somerset Local Plan (2000).

3. No work shall be carried out on site unless the method and detail of the blocking up of existing internal openings has been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the special architectural and historic interests of the Listed Building in accordance with PPG15 and EH3 of the South Somerset Local Plan (2000).

4. No work shall be carried out on site unless details of all new and replacement plasters, renders, floor surfaces, ceilings etc, including any making good of any existing structure abutting any of those to be demolished, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such approved details, once carried out shall not be altered without the prior written consent of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the special architectural and historic interests of the Listed Building in accordance with PPG15 and EH3 of the South Somerset Local Plan (2000).

5. No work shall be carried out on site unless details of the new staircase, including detailed design, materials and finish are to be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This will include detailed drawings including sections of at least 1:5. Such approved details, once carried out shall not be altered without the prior written consent of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the special architectural and historic interests of the Listed Building in accordance with PPG15 and EH3 of the South Somerset Local Plan (2000).

6. No work shall be carried out on site unless full construction details of the new partitions and finishes have been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such details shall show new partitions scribed around, not cut into the existing cornices, skirting or other features.

Reason: In the interests of the special architectural and historic interests of the Listed Building in accordance with PPG15 and EH3 of the South Somerset Local Plan (2000).

7. The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out otherwise than in complete accordance with the submitted plans and specifications as amended by drawing number 962/46/JD/07 revision B dated 14/03/2008.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt as to the development authorised as the submitted proposal has been amended.
